

**MINUTES OF THE 144TH MEETING OF THE INSTITUTE
BODY HELD ON 16TH JANUARY, 2012 AT 12.00 NOON IN
THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE,
NIRMAN BHAWAN, NEW DELHI.**

The 144th meeting of the Institute Body of All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi was held on 16th January, 2012 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi. The followings members attended the meeting:-

- 1) Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad -- President
Union Minister of Health & F.W.,
Nirman Bhawan,
New Delhi-110 011
- 2) Smt. Sushma Swaraj, -- Member
Member of Parliament (LS)
8, Safdarjung Lane,
New Delhi – 110 011
- 3) Shri Motilal Vora, -- Member
Member of Parliament (RS)
33, Lodhi Estate,
New Delhi
- 4) Dr. Jyoti Mirdha, -- Member
Member of Parliament (LS)
31, Meena Bagh,
New Delhi.
- 5) Ms. Vibha Puri Das, -- Member
Secretary to the Govt. of India,
Department of Higher Education,
Ministry of Human Resource Development
Shastri Bhawan,
New Delhi-110 001
- 6) Dr. M.K. Bhan, -- Member
Secretary to the Govt. of India,
Deptt. of Biotechnology,
Ministry of Science & Technology,
CGO Complex, Lodhi Road,
New Delhi – 110 003

- | | | | |
|-----|---|----|------------------|
| 7) | Dr. Jagdish Prasad,
Director General of Health Services,
Government of India,
Nirman Bhawan,
New Delhi-110 011 | -- | Member |
| 8) | Shri R.K. Jain,
Addl. Secretary & Financial Adviser
Government of India,
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare,
Nirman Bhawan,
New Delhi-110 011 | -- | Member |
| 9) | Dr. S.P. Agarwal,
Secretary General,
Indian Red Cross Society,
Rafi Marg,
New Delhi | -- | Member |
| 10) | Dr. K.K. Talwar,
President,
National Academy of Medical Sciences,
Ansari Nagar,
New Delhi – 110 029 | -- | Member |
| 11) | Dr. R.C. Deka,
Director,
All India Institute of Medical Sciences,
Ansari Nagar,
New Delhi – 110 029 | -- | Member-Secretary |

Shri P.K Pradhan, Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare; Prof. Dinesh Singh, Vice-Chancellor, Delhi University; Dr. Abdul Hamid Zargar, Medical Director, Advance Centre for Diabetics & Endocrine Care, Srinagar, Dr. R.A. Badwae, Director, Tata Memorial Hospital, Mumbai; Dr. Ramakant Panda, Vice-Chairman, Asian Heart Institute, Mumbai and Dr. K.C. Pandey, Deptt. of Zoology, Lucknow University, Lucknow could not attend the meeting.

Shri Debasish Panda, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare attended the meeting as a Special Invitee.

Dr. Rani Kumar, Dean (Academic), Dr. D.K. Sharma, MS, and Shri Sandeep Lall, Sr. Financial Adviser, AIIMS also attended the meeting.

The President called the meeting to order and noted that 11 members out of 17 were present. Thus the quorum was complete.

The President, thereafter, welcomed the Hon'ble Members to the Institute Body meeting and wished them a Happy New Year.

The Director also welcomed the Hon'ble Members to the 144th meeting of the Institute Body and wished them Happy New Year. He also introduced Sh. R.K. Jain, Addl. Secretary & Financial Adviser and Dr. Jagdish Prasad, Director General of Health Services as newly nominated members of the Institute Body.

Item No.IB-144/1

Confirmation of the minutes of the 143rd meeting of the Institute Body held on 11.05.2010 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

The Institute Body noted that the minutes of the 143rd meeting had been circulated to all members on 9.11.2010 and no objections/comments had been received from any member.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha expressed her reservations over promotions under APS given to 164 faculty members who had initially been appointed on ad hoc basis, especially when the matter was sub-judice and the court had given no directions for such promotions. The President clarified that there were no orders from the court restraining these promotions even though such directions had been sought from the court by the petitioners. The promotions were also subject to the final outcome of the Writ Petition as mentioned by Director. Smt. Sushma Swaraj confirmed that the promotions were subject to final outcome of the petition. The regularization of services as also the benefit of counting ad hoc services of such appointees for purposes of promotion had been approved as a onetime measure by the then IB in 2003. The Director also further confirmed about it as per the record of then I.B.

With this discussion, the minutes of the 143rd meeting of the Institute Body were confirmed as circulated.

Item No.IB-144/2

Action taken on the minutes of the 143rd meeting of the Institute Body held on 11.05.2010 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

The Action Taken Note was perused by the Institute Body.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha reiterated the reservations expressed by her in the 143rd meeting about the competence and ability of HSCC. It was clarified that in all works, HSCC functions primarily as a transaction advisor/consultant. The construction agencies were selected through a process of open tenders. Further, HSCC was a PSU of Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and its existence could not be ignored. Moreover, the ESD of AIIMS did not have the wherewithal to execute such high value projects. It was also clarified that under the current master plan, 185% FAR had been achieved. This would go up further once individual building plans were submitted for vetting by statutory bodies like NDMC and DUAC.

Thereafter, the ATN was approved as circulated.

Item No.IB-144/3

To consider the minutes of the 143rd meeting of the Governing Body held on 26th November, 2009 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

Approved.

Item No.IB-144/4

To consider the minutes of the 144th meeting of the Governing Body held on 27th November, 2010 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha pointed out that the minutes were not recorded properly for which she drew the attention of the members towards the qualification for super speciality posts and said that minutes of one agenda item were recorded in another agenda and the same were not corrected despite a letter from the DGHS. She desired that the same should be corrected.

It was clarified that this issue had been discussed in the 146th meeting of the Governing Body which had preceded the IB meeting. The GB had decided to further amend the Recruitment Rules for super speciality faculty posts to provide that the minimum educational qualification would be DM/MCh and only in case of non availability candidates with MD/MS and 3 years training in the speciality would be considered as the equivalent essential qualification for that purpose. The Director, AIIMS however reiterated that both in PGI & AIIMS, it was so decided to attract NRI doctors from USA and the UK, where there was no such DM/MCh Degrees.

The minutes were accordingly approved as circulated.

Item No.IB-144/5

To consider the minutes of the 145th meeting of the Governing Body held on 1st March, 2011 in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

Approved.

Item No.IB-144/6

To consider the report of the High Powered Committee constituted for examining the recommendations of the Valiathan Committee requiring structural changes through amendments in AIIMS Act, Rules and Regulations.

Shri Debasish Panda, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and Member Secretary of the High Powered Committee briefed the members that in the 2nd Part of the Valiathan Committee, there were recommendations for structural changes in the AIIMS Act, Rules & Regulations. Accordingly, a High Powered Committee was constituted under the then Health Secretary.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha informed that a Sub Committee of the Department Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare had been examining the functioning of the Institute. The Sub Committee had examined Ms. Sujatha Rao, Dr. Valiathan and the recommendations of the Valiathan Committee were also being considered. She informed that the Valiathan Committee Report was the thoughts of Dr. Valiathan alone as none of the other members attended the meeting and there were dissenting notes from the Health Secretary and the DGHS. Thus, the recommendations in the Valiathan Committee Report were the opinion/views of Dr. Valiathan alone. Similarly, the report of the High Powered Committee was prepared by a few bureaucrats. This was followed by a general discussion over rejecting the Dr. M.S. Valiathan Committee Recommendations.

Smt. Sushma Swaraj suggested that before any decision is taken, report of the Standing Parliamentary Committee which was examining AIIMS should be awaited and subsequently a special meeting on the report should be convened. It was accordingly decided.

Item No.IB-144/7

To consider the report submitted by the Committee constituted under the Chairmanship of Dr. M.K. Bhan, Secretary, Department of Biotechnology for looking into the aspect of improvement of standards of research in the Institute of Medical Education under Department of Health & Family Welfare.

Dr. M.K. Bhan expressed his concern that research in India is deteriorating rapidly while countries like Brazil are ahead of India in the matter of medical research. He opined that AIIMS being an apex Institution, should excel in everything. He informed that out of 300 medical colleges only ten medical institutions published 95% of research papers and rest even did not understand what research was. He pointed out that the general impression in these medical colleges is that research was the source of abstract. He also pointed out that the research in apex institutions is very bad and research was being done only in CMC Vellore, AIIMS, New Delhi, PGI, Chandigarh and few more institutions. He felt a serious need to identify the institutions, whether private or government, to work on certain ideas according to their capacity.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha pointed out that this report would also be considered by the Sub Committee of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare. Dr. Bhan expressed his reservation on the views expressed by Dr. Mirdha.

Taking into consideration the views expressed by Dr. M.K. Bhan, it was decided to consider the report in a separate meeting of the Institute Body.

Item No.IB-144/8

To consider the letter received from Government about reservation of posts at AIIMS.

After considerable discussion, the IB decided that a committee be set up to identify scientific and technical posts at AIIMS.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha objected to the letter dated 19.10.2010 written by the DD(A), AIIMS to the Health Secretary. She drew attention in particular to the last line of the second last paragraph. The President decided that the letter need not be a part of the IB record.

The Director, however, informed that the AIIMS has been following the policy of reservation in Faculty selection and for other posts including Senior Residents in AIIMS. He further added that the interview is being held following the newly made roster.

Item No.IB-144/9

To consider the Special Report 2008 of National Commission for Scheduled Castes (NCSC) on incidents of caste based discrimination and harassment and action to be taken at All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS), New Delhi.

The President informed the members that this matter had been deliberated upon in the preceding meeting of the Governing Body and a decision was taken to treat the matter as closed.

The President pointed out that the institute had come over the phase of unrest and, a congenial atmosphere was prevailing in the institute and majority of persons against whom allegations have been leveled have either retired or left the institute. It may not be feasible to take action against them. Supporting the views of the President, Smt. Sushma Swaraj observed that action should have been taken around the period of incident and now the accused officials had retired and the grievances have been redressed and normalcy has been restored. She also said that congenial atmosphere has been created ever since Dr. Deka took over as Director and any action will only disturb the harmony. Moreover, measures had been taken to curb such situation in future so that such incidents are not repeated.

The President also informed that in the preceding meeting of the Governing Body it had also been decided to constitute a Committee to address Grievances of SCs/STs.

In view of above deliberation it was unanimously decided that the matter may be treated as closed and the same may be communicated to the Ministry for further necessary action.

Item No.IB-144/10

To consider the report of the Sneh Bhargava Committee set up by MOHFW for determining work standards for faculty.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha expressed concern over the appointment of Dean (Research) which she mentioned as irregular as also the appointment of Sub Deans. She drew attention to contractual appointment of faculty despite the process of regular recruitment having been initiated. She also pointed out that 4 to 5 consultants had been appointed by the DD(A) without any advertisement.

Dr. Jyoti Mirdha observed that the current Standing Selection Committee comprised only of medical doctors who had proved indifferent to the sensitivities of 39 faculty members and had graded them as unfit for promotion. Such situations had never occurred whenever a member of parliament was a member of the Standing Selection Committee.

Dr. Bhan lamented the archaic rules and procedures being used to hold back growth of the Institute. He pleaded for deshackling the Institute from political and bureaucratic control and for empowering the Institute Body to take decisions at its own level. The Director also expressed similar views.

The Institute Body, therefore, decided to consider the Sneh Bhargva Committee Report in the next meeting.

Item No. IB-144/11

To consider the appointment of the Chairperson of the Academic Committee of the Institute.

Not taken up for discussion.

The meeting of the Institute Body came to close with a vote of thanks to all present.

Ramesh M. Joshi
17/2/12